



**STAFF REPORT  
FOR THE HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD**

**FILE NUMBER:** DR-12-17

**HEARING DATE:** October 16, 2012

**REQUEST:** Opening Enlargement and Reduction, Porch Alterations

**APPROVAL  
CRITERIA:** Community Development Code (CDC) Chapter 26, Historic Landmarks

**STAFF REPORT  
PREPARED BY:** Sara Javoronok, Associate Planner

---

Planning Director's Review \_\_\_\_\_

---

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The applicant is proposing to enlarge or reduce several openings on the side and rear facades and alter the front porch of the residence at 1562 Buck Street. These alterations are subject to the approval criteria in CDC Chapter 26, Historic Landmark.

The subject property is located on the south side of Buck Street between Holmes and Irving Streets. It is approximately two blocks east of the Bolton Fire Station. The residence was built c. 1900 and is a vernacular structure.

Staff finds that the applicant's proposal, supplemented with three conditions of approval, meets the applicable criteria. Therefore, staff recommends approval.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## **STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	1
GENERAL INFORMATION.....	3
BACKGROUND.....	4
ANALYSIS .....	7
RECOMMENDATION.....	7

## **ADDENDUM**

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS .....	8
---	---

## **EXHIBITS**

HRB-1 AFFIDAVIT OF NOTICE.....	11
HRB-2 NOTICE MAILING PACKET.....	12
HRB-3 APPLICANT SUBMITTAL .....	16
HRB-4 HISTORIC SITE INVENTORY FORMS.....	28
HRB-5 DR-08-04 FINAL DECISION, STAFF REPORT AND APPLICANT SUBMITTAL .....	30

## GENERAL INFORMATION

**APPLICANT/  
OWNER:** Bonnie Mangene

**SITE LOCATION:** 1562 Buck Street

**LEGAL  
DESCRIPTION:** Clackamas County Assessor's Map 22E-30BB, Tax Lot 1400

**SITE SIZE:** 5,000 square feet

**ZONING:** R-5, Single Family Residential Detached

**COMP PLAN  
DESIGNATION:** Medium Density Residential

**120-DAY PERIOD:** The application was complete on September 17, 2012. Therefore, the 120-day application processing period ends on January 15, 2013.

**PUBLIC NOTICE:** Public notice was mailed to the Bolton Neighborhood Association and to affected property owners on September 28, 2012 and the application has been posted on the City's website. Therefore, notice requirements have been satisfied.

## BACKGROUND

As previously noted, the subject property is located in the Bolton neighborhood on Buck Street between Holmes and Irving Streets.



Site Conditions. The property is an individually designated local landmark site. The lot currently accommodates a single family house, constructed c. 1900. There is also a detached garage on the site, which was constructed c. 1970. The property was included in the 1984 Clackamas County Cultural Resource Inventory (Clackamas County Inventory) and the 2009 Buck Street Survey. The survey forms are attached as Exhibit HRB-4.

The residence has a truncated hip roof with a fascia board. It is sided with shiplap and has an encircling front porch with turned posts. The windows are elongated 1/1 windows and have replacement sashes along with architrave molding. The front entry door is paneled with a transom window above, and architrave molding around it. (see following photos).

Prior to the establishment of the City of West Linn Historic Review Board, in 2008 the Clackamas County Historic Review Board reviewed a proposal for the addition of a second story to the rear of this residence. This proposal was submitted by a previous owner. Some work was completed on this project, including the construction of a staircase in the interior of the residence. The staff report and plans for this project are attached as Exhibit HRB-5.



*Front elevation (2009)*



*Front and side elevation (2009)*



*Front elevation (September 2012)*



*Front and side elevation (September 2012)*



*Rear elevation (2012)*



*Side elevation (2012)*



*Existing side elevation window (2012)*

**Project Description.** The applicant is proposing changes to the side and rear elevations of the structure. On the west elevation, the applicant proposes to remove the existing boarded window and install a smaller 2' square window. On the interior, a previous owner constructed stairs behind the boarded window for a planned second story (see Exhibit HRB-5 for the plans submitted as part of a prior application), consequently the window is no longer functional. On the rear elevation, which is an historic addition, the applicant proposes to remove the existing slider window and install a sliding door with sidelight windows. The applicant also wants to remove the existing door and replace it with siding to match the existing shiplap siding. On the east side elevation, the applicant plans to remove the existing windows, which currently have plexiglass, and replace them with siding to match the existing siding. The applicant also proposes to add a small 2' square window that matches the window on the west elevation.

For the porch, the applicant is proposing to enclose the existing turned posts to provide additional visual and physical weight. The applicant has also removed the balustrade, which appears in the 2009 Buck Street Survey photo, but does not appear to be in the Clackamas County Inventory; however, this could be due to the low quality of the image.

**Surrounding Land Use.** The parcel is surrounded by residential properties that are zoned R-5. The Bolton Fire Station, located off of Highway 43, is a few blocks away.

DIRECTION FROM SITE	LAND USE	ZONING
North	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5
East	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5
South	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5
West	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5



Public comments. To date, staff has not received any comments from the public.

## ANALYSIS

CDC Chapter 26, Historic Landmarks applies to this project, specifically Section 26.060(C) related to alterations and relocations. The project is generally consistent with the criteria; however, staff is recommending that the applicant install wood or fiberglass windows that would more closely match the original windows. Staff acknowledges that the historic windows have been removed and replaced with vinyl windows, but these replacements do not match the visual qualities of the originals and staff does not recommend continuing to use them.

The applicant is also proposing to physically and visually bolster the front porch columns. The columns appear to be historic and staff recommends retaining the existing columns or replacing them in kind rather than altering their appearance.

## RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application subject to the following conditions:

1. Site Plan, Elevations, and Narrative. The project shall conform to the plans, elevations, and narrative submitted in Exhibit HRB-3, with the exception of modifications required by the following conditions.
2. Windows. The replacement window sashes shall be wood, fiberglass, or another material that exhibits similar visual qualities, subject to Planning Department approval.
3. Porch columns. The porch columns shall be the same size and shape of the historic columns.

## Notes to applicant.

- Expiration of Approval. This approval shall expire three years from the effective date of this decision.
- Additional Permits Required. Your project may require the following additional permits:
  - Public improvement permit: contact Pat in Engineering at (503) 723-5501 or [prich@westlinnoregon.gov](mailto:prich@westlinnoregon.gov)
  - Public works permit: contact Pat in Engineering at (503) 723-5501 or [prich@westlinnoregon.gov](mailto:prich@westlinnoregon.gov)
  - On-Site Utilities: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, [jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov](mailto:jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov). (Electrical permits are through Clackamas County, not the City of West Linn.)
  - Building permit: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, [jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov](mailto:jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov).
  - Final inspection, for occupancy: Call the Building Division's Inspection Line at (503) 722-5509.

# APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS

DR-12-17

## CHAPTER 26, HISTORIC LANDMARKS

### 26.060 ALTERATION AND DEVELOPMENT CRITERIA

*A. Purpose. It is the intent of this section to provide for an appropriate level of review for a proposed alteration to an historic landmark, and proposed development on a site containing an historic landmark, as well as to provide criteria ensuring effective and efficient review of such proposed alteration and development.*

...

*C. Alterations and relocations. The Historic Review Board shall review all proposed relocations and all alterations which exceed a "minor" status under subsection B of this section. A request for a relocation or alteration permit under this provision shall be made on the appropriate application form provided by the Department of Planning and Development. Review and approval of an application shall be based on findings of adherence to the following criteria:*

*1. Retention of original construction. Distinguishing original qualities defining a structure's character shall not be destroyed. Removal or alteration of historic materials or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.*

**FINDING 1:** The applicant is proposing to remove or enlarge several openings on the structure and alter the front porch columns. In terms of the openings, they are on secondary facades and a rear addition, and are not easily visible from the public right-of-way. Their removal or alteration would not significantly impact the character of the structure. In addition, the historic windows have been replaced with vinyl windows and with recommended Condition of Approval 2, the applicant would install wood or other windows with visual qualities that would more closely match the originals, which would return some of the original character to the structure.

The porch columns appear to be historic elements on the structure. They both appeared on the 1984 and 2009 historic resource inventories (Exhibit HRB-4). Staff considers these to be character defining features of the vernacular residence and recommends repair and replacement in-kind rather than altering their appearance, which is addressed in recommended Condition of Approval 3.

*2. Time period consistency. Structures shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations which have no historical basis or which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be avoided.*



**FINDING 2:** The applicant is proposing to replace the porch columns. Staff recommends retaining this feature. This is addressed in the recommended Condition of Approval 3.

*3. Visual integrity/style. Distinctive stylistic features, such as a line of columns, piers, spandrels, or other primary structural elements, or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a structure, shall be maintained or restored as far as is practicable.*

**FINDING 3:** The proposed changes to the openings, with the addition of Condition of Approval 2, will not affect the visual integrity or style of the structure. The proposed changes are on secondary elevations and an historic addition, which are easily visible from the right-of-way. The proposed changes to the porch columns affect a distinctive stylistic feature and in recommended Condition of Approval 3 staff recommends repair or replacement in-kind.

*4. Replacement or addition materials. Whenever possible, deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced. In the event replacement of an existing feature is necessary or an addition is proposed, new materials should match those of the original structure to the extent possible in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.*

**FINDING 4:** For the openings, and as noted above, with the recommended Condition of Approval 2, the alteration and replacement would be completed with doors and windows that match or have similar visual qualities to the originals. The reduction in the side window opening is due to it no longer being a functional window with the addition of the stairs. These changes would match the original structure to the extent possible in terms of design, color, and other visual qualities.

For the porch columns, and as noted above, with the recommended Condition of Approval 3, repair or replacement in-kind would be appropriate.

*5. Building height. Existing building heights should be maintained. Alteration of roof pitches shall be avoided. Raising or lowering a structure's permanent elevation when constructing a foundation shall be avoided, except as required by building code or floodplain overlay zone.*

**FINDING 5:** The applicant is not proposing to alter the building height, roof pitch, or foundation height. Not applicable.

*6. Horizontal additions. The scale and proportion of building additions, including the relationship of windows to walls, shall be visually compatible with the traditional architectural character of the historic building. Contemporary construction for alterations and additions is acceptable if the design respects the building's original design and is compatible with the original scale, materials, and window and door opening proportions of the structure.*

**FINDING 6:** The applicant is not proposing an addition. Not applicable.

7. *Windows. Window replacements shall match the visual qualities of original windows as closely as possible. Wood window frames are preferred in meeting this standard. However, if non-wood replacements exhibit similar visual qualities as their wooden counterparts, they may be acceptable. The original number of window panes shall be maintained or restored when replacements are required.*

**FINDING 7:** The applicant is proposing vinyl windows, which do not have the same visual qualities as wood windows. Staff addresses this in the recommended Condition of Approval 2.

8. *Restoration possible. Except where the building code precludes it, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure could be restored.*

**FINDING 8:** The proposed changes, with the recommended Conditions of Approval provide for alterations that do not change the essential form and integrity of the original structure. The criterion is met.

9. *Signs, lighting. Signs, lighting, and other appurtenances, such as walls, fences, awnings, and landscaping, shall be visually compatible with the scale and traditional architectural character of the historic building.*

**FINDING 9:** The applicant is not proposing lighting or signs. Not applicable.