



STAFF REPORT FOR THE HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD

FILE NUMBER: DR-12-02

HEARING DATE: February 21, 2012

REQUEST: Rear addition, Residing and Front Porch Alterations

APPROVAL

CRITERIA: Community Development Code (CDC) Chapter 25, Historic District

STAFF REPORT

PREPARED BY: Sara Javoronok, Associate Planner

Planning Director's Review _____

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant is proposing to add a rear addition, reside with a different material, and alter the front porch of the residence at 1852 4th Avenue. These alterations are subject to the approval criteria in CDC Chapter 25, Historic District.

The subject property is located on the north side of 4th Avenue between 12th and 13th Streets. It is in the City's Willamette Neighborhood, local Willamette Historic District, and the National Register Willamette Falls Neighborhood Historic District. The residence was built in 1984 and the 2006 reconnaissance level survey of the neighborhood reported its style as Neo-Colonial and classified it as not-in-period.

Staff finds that the applicant's proposal, supplemented with a condition of approval, meets the applicable criteria. Therefore, staff recommends approval.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
GENERAL INFORMATION	3
BACKGROUND	4
ANALYSIS	6
RECOMMENDATION	7

ADDENDUM

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS	8
---	---

EXHIBITS

HRB-1 AFFIDAVIT OF NOTICE.....	14
HRB-2 NOTICE MAILING PACKET.....	15
HRB-3 APPLICANT SUBMITTAL	19
HRB-4 HISTORIC SITE INVENTORY FORM.....	45

GENERAL INFORMATION

APPLICANT/ OWNER:	Elizabeth Smolens & Aron Helligas
SITE LOCATION:	1852 4 th Ave.
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	Clackamas County Assessor's Map 31E-02BD, Tax Lot 500
SITE SIZE:	5,000 square feet
ZONING:	R-5, Single Family Residential Detached
COMP PLAN DESIGNATION:	Medium Density Residential
120-DAY PERIOD:	The application was complete on January 20, 2012. Therefore, the 120-day application processing period ends on May 21, 2012.
PUBLIC NOTICE:	Public notice was mailed to the Willamette Neighborhood Association and to affected property owners on January 30, 2012 and the application has been posted on the City's website. Therefore, notice requirements have been satisfied.

BACKGROUND

As previously noted, the subject property is located in the Willamette neighborhood and Willamette Historic District at 1852 4th Avenue, between 12th and 13th Streets.



Site Conditions. The lot currently accommodates a 1½ story single family house with an attached two-car garage and was constructed in 1984. The property was included in the 2006 Reconnaissance Level Survey of the Willamette Falls Neighborhood Historic District. The survey form is attached as Exhibit HRB-4.

The residence has a side gabled roof with a front facing dormer window. The attached garage has a front facing gable and a window in the gable end. Below the dormer window, there is an existing porch with Neo-Colonial fluted columns. The porch is one-half the length of the front elevation and the attached garage comprises the remainder of the front elevation. The Sanborn maps do not show a house or other structure on this property.



Front elevation



Rear and side elevation



Rear yard, proposed location of addition



Rear yard screening/vegetation

Project Description. The applicant is proposing to add a rear addition, reside the house, and alter the front porch. For the rear addition, the applicant is proposing an 11 x 19 ft. addition with paired windows on the east and west elevations and single-lite French doors. Currently, the house is sided with vinyl siding and the applicant is proposing wood shingles. The porch alterations include a false arch over the entry and left bay, new square columns with wood trim, and a wood railing. The applicant is also planning on removing the diagonal trim on the garage to square the overhead door opening.

Surrounding Land Use. The parcel is surrounded by residential properties. Those on the north side of Fourth Avenue are zoned R-5, while those on the south are zoned R-10.

DIRECTION FROM SITE	LAND USE	ZONING
North	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5
East	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5
South	Single-family residential detached	R-10
West	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5



Public comments. To date, staff has not received any comments from the public.

ANALYSIS

CDC Chapter 25, Historic District applies to this project, specifically Sections 25.060, 25.070, 25.080, and 25.150.

The applicant is proposing two changes that trigger Section 25.150, Design Modification Procedures. The first is a two-foot modification from the rear yard setback requirement in 25.070 B, and the second is a modification from the siding requirements in Section 25.050 J. Section 25.150 Design Modification Procedures specifies the requirements for a modification. Unlike other areas of the City, Chapter 75, Variances, does not apply in the Willamette Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application subject to the following condition:

1. Site Plan, Elevations, and Narrative. The project shall conform to the plans, elevations, and narrative submitted in Exhibit HRB-3.

Notes to applicant.

- Expiration of Approval. This approval shall expire three years from the effective date of this decision.
- Additional Permits Required. Your project may require the following additional permits:
 - Public improvement permit: contact Pat in Engineering at (503) 723-5501 or prich@westlinnoregon.gov
 - Public works permit: contact Pat in Engineering at (503) 723-5501 or prich@westlinnoregon.gov
 - On-Site Utilities: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov. (Electrical permits are through Clackamas County, not the City of West Linn.)
 - Building permit: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov.
 - Final inspection, for occupancy: Call the Building Division's Inspection Line at (503) 722-5509.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS

DR-12-02

CHAPTER 25, HISTORIC DISTRICT

25.060 CRITERIA FOR EXTERIOR ALTERATION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION

- A. *Except as provided pursuant to CDC 25.100, no person may alter the exterior of any structure in an Historic District in a manner as to affect its exterior appearance, nor may any new structure be constructed in an Historic District, unless the site and evaluation drawings are approved by the Historic Review Board.*
- B. *Exterior remodeling as governed by this chapter shall include any change or alteration in design or other exterior treatment excluding painting.*
- C. *For new home construction or exterior alterations of structures in an Historic District, the criteria to be used by the Historic Review Board in reaching the decision shall include the following:*
 - 1. *The purpose of the Historic District as set forth in CDC 25.040.*
 - 2. *The policies of the West Linn Comprehensive Plan.*
 - 3. *The economic use of the structure in an Historic District and the reasonableness of the proposed alteration and their relationship to the public interest in the structure's or landmark's preservation or renovation. (Applicable to commercial only.)*
 - 4. *The value and significance of the structure or landmark in an Historic District. (Applicable to remodeling only.)*
 - 5. *The physical condition of the structure or landmark in an Historic District. (Applicable to remodeling only.)*
 - 6. *The general compatibility of exterior design, arrangement, proportion, detail, scale, color, texture and materials proposed to be used with an existing structure in an Historic District.*
 - 7. *Pertinent aesthetic factors as designed by the Historic Review Board.*
 - 8. *Economic, social, environmental and energy consequences related to LCDC Goal No. 5. (Ord. 1594 § 1 (Exh. A), 2010)*

FINDING NO. 1: The applicant's proposal will be reviewed by the Historic Review Board. Staff finds that the value, significance, physical condition, compatibility, and aesthetic impacts of this not-in-period residence have been considered and will be impacted as little as possible. The impacts of the proposed changes to contributing residences in the district have also been considered. The criteria are met.

25.070 APPROVAL CRITERIA FOR REMODELS, NEW HOME AND ACCESSORY STRUCTURE CONSTRUCTION

- B. Siting.
 - 1. Front yard:
 - a. *The front yard setback shall be the distance measured from the front property line to the dominant vertical face of the building, exclusive of any porches or front landings, equal to the average of the front setbacks of adjacent homes. For corner lots, the setback shall be the average between the adjacent house to the side and 20 feet.*
 - b. *Unenclosed porches with no living space above may encroach six feet further from the dominant vertical face of the building.*

2. Side yard: Five feet shall be the standard; however, where adjacent structures encroach into the required side yard, the Planning Director may reduce one of the side yards to a minimum of three feet to center a new structure between existing buildings, provided no space between buildings is reduced below eight feet. To encourage sidewall variation, "pop outs," including chimneys, may intrude 18 inches into side yard setback.
3. Side street: 10 feet for both developed and undeveloped street. To encourage sidewall variation, "pop outs," including chimneys, may intrude 24 inches into side street yard setback after every 400 square feet of sidewall.
4. Rear yard: The rear yard setback shall be a minimum of 20 feet, except for accessory structures (non-dwelling or non-accessory dwelling units (ADU)), which may be sited to within three feet of the side or rear property lines. See section on ADUs for ADU setbacks.
5. Orientation: New home construction on corner lots must orient the front of the house to the avenue and not the street.
6. Lot coverage: 50 percent. Unlike the rest of West Linn, lot coverage shall apply to the new and remodeled primary dwellings, attached and detached garages, all accessory buildings and ADUs. Decks, paved and impermeable surfaces (patios and driveways etc.) shall not be included. Underlying zone (e.g., R-5) lot coverage shall not apply.

FINDING NO. 2: Criterion 1 does not apply to the rear addition. For #2, the proposed rear addition will not decrease the existing side yard setback, which is 7.5 feet to the west and approximately 7.5 feet to the east. Criterion 3 does not apply. For #4, the lot depth is 100 feet, and the rear of the proposed structure will be approximately 18 feet from the rear lot line, two feet less than the required 20 feet. See Finding No. 13 for Criterion 4, which the applicant is requesting a modification from. Criterion 5 does not apply. For #6, lot coverage, the total is approximately 34 percent, less than the 50 percent permitted. Criteria 1 and 2 are met.

D. Building height. (Note: Buildings in Willamette Town vary in height; most evident are one and one-half story Victorians and bungalows. Some buildings reach two stories, and there are several single-story structures as well.)

1. No building shall exceed the height of 28 feet to the dominant gable or roof ridgeline as measured per Chapter 02 CDC. This restriction shall apply regardless of the existing or finished grade of the site.
2. In order to transition in scale, new houses that are taller than homes adjacent to them must have the predominant roof ridgeline extending perpendicular to the front property line so that the roof slopes down on the sides to effect that transition. Dormers are allowed on that sloping roof area facing the adjacent home(s) but cannot constitute more than 25 percent of the roof as measured lineally or horizontally (e.g., if roof is 50 feet long the dormer(s) cannot be more than 25 percent of that distance or 12.5 feet long in total). Also, the dormer height must be at least two feet below the gable ridgeline height.
3. Cupolas and towers are not excluded from the aforementioned height limitation.
4. Alteration of roof pitches or raising or lowering a structure's permanent elevation, when constructing a foundation, shall be avoided.
5. The original height of the structure's front elevation shall be preserved. Additions to the rear portion of the house shall be allowed where those additions do not compromise the character of the front elevation or the scale or significantly modify the mass of the house as seen from the right-of-way.

FINDING NO. 3: Criteria 2-4 do not apply. The proposed addition will be approximately 18 feet from grade. The lot gently slopes to the south. The peak of the gable on the addition is approximately the same height as the gable on the garage. The addition will not compromise the character of the front elevation or the scale of the residence. It will also not significantly modify the

mass of the house as seen from the right-of-way. With screening, the addition will be minimally visible from the right-of-way in the alley. It will not be visible from the 4th Avenue or 12th Street rights-of-way. The applicable criteria are met.

E. Building shapes and sizes.

- 1. No building on a 50-foot-wide lot shall exceed 35 feet in overall width. Lots with a 65-foot width or greater may have a building width of 40 feet plus the porches, eaves or veranda extensions so that the maximum total width is 47 feet.*
- 2. End walls (street facing) shall be designed with consideration of scale and aesthetic character of the main facade.*
- 3. Buildings shall avoid a horizontal orientation in their roof and window designs, unless the design can be shown to match the original roof design or approximate the design of nearby structures and styles.*
- 4. Sidewalls on the side of new homes shall have a minimum 18-inch "pop out" or indent after every 400 square feet of sidewall measured laterally/horizontally. The "pop out" or indent shall be at least six feet wide and shall be at least nine feet tall. (Bay windows could qualify). Sidewalls on the side street side of new homes shall have minimum 24-inch "pop out" or indent after every 400 square feet of sidewall measured laterally/horizontally. "Pop outs" may intrude into the setback area.*

FINDING NO. 4: For #1, the proposed rear addition is 19 feet, less than the maximum permitted. Criteria 2-4 do not apply. The applicable criterion is met.

G. Horizontal additions.

- 1. The scale and proportion of building additions, including the relationship of windows to walls, shall be visually compatible with the traditional architectural character of the historic building.*
- 2. Contemporary construction for alterations and additions are acceptable if the design respects the building's original design and is compatible with the original scale, materials, window and door opening proportions of the structure.*

FINDING NO. 5: The scale and proportion of the proposed addition, including the proposed entry and windows are visually compatible with the architectural character of the not-in-period residence. The proposed addition maintains the roof pitch and architectural features of the original section of the residence. It has a compatible scale, similar materials and window and door openings that are proportional to the original section of the residence.

H. Windows. Window sizes vary considerably in the district. Windows on the primary and secondary structures are wood sash, usually a double hung type. Victorian styled structures typically have narrower, vertically-oriented windows. Bungalow styled structures from the "Craftsman" era (1905 – 1930) may have wider windows with mullions across the top of larger paned areas. Most windows have fairly wide trim boards, usually five inches. Standards:

- 1. Historic window sashes and frames shall be repaired rather than replaced unless the approval authority determines that repair is not possible. In that case, the replacement shall match the old window sash and frame in design, texture, materials, and other visual qualities. Existing replacement windows shall be replaced with windows that match the original window in design, texture, and other visual qualities, and, where possible, materials, as determined by the approval authority. Windows in new construction and*

additions shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the structure. Wood windows are preferred.

- 2. Aluminum windows are prohibited unless they were the original materials and meet dimensional standards.*
- 3. Windows shall be surrounded by exterior trim on the top and sides; window trim shall be at least four and one-half inches minimum width unless the original window was less.*
- 4. Window replacements shall match the visual qualities of original windows.*
- 5. Storm windows should follow the standards for windows and shall have a mullion that matches the divide between the upper and lower window sashes. The color should match underlying trim.*

FINDING NO. 6: The applicant is proposing casement windows that are a composite material, Fibrex. The size and scale of the windows are compatible with the existing residence. The residence is not historic. The proposed windows are compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of residence. The trim is not identified and staff recommends adopting the condition stating that the trim on the windows shall be at least four and one-half inches wide or match the existing trim on the residence. Criteria 2, 4, and 5 do not apply. The applicable criteria are met.

- I. Entryways. Porches are a key architectural feature on most homes in Willamette Town. Frequently, the porch and entryway creates a dominant architectural feature on the main facade. On corner lots, the entry usually faces the east-west avenues. Front doors are often notably detailed; many contain glass panes or carvings. Standards:*
- 1. Buildings shall have a permanently protected entry. Awnings are not permanent protection.*
 - 2. All main entrances should face the avenues.*
 - 3. Flush (flat) doors are prohibited.*
 - 4. Doors with windowed areas are recommended. Front porch enclosure of any dwelling unit may not be enclosed. Back porches may be enclosed.*

FINDING NO. 7: There is a single entry on the proposed addition. The applicant is proposing French doors made of a composite material, Fibrex, which is also proposed for the windows. The doors each have a single lite. The applicable criteria are met.

- J. Siding and exterior finish. Standards:*
- 1. Horizontal wood siding shall be the primary exterior finish.*
 - 2. Shingles should only be used in conjunction with horizontal wood siding.*
 - 3. Single color exteriors are discouraged. Stained exteriors are not recommended.*

FINDING NO. 8: Currently, the residence has vinyl siding and the applicant is proposing to replace the vinyl siding with wood shingles. This does not meet Criteria 1 and 2 which state that horizontal wood siding shall be the primary exterior finish and that shingles should only be used in conjunction with horizontal wood siding. See Finding No. 13 pertaining to the modification that the applicant is seeking.

- K. Roofscape. Standards:*
- 1. Roofs shall have a pitch of at least 8:12 to maintain the pattern of steep roof pitches. The Historic Review Board will consider deviations from the 8:12 to 12:12 standard for additions to the main body of the house so long as it is consistent with a particular architectural style.*
 - 2. Roofing materials should be asphalt composite shingles. Milled cedar shingles may only be used if they are replacing milled cedar shingles or if they were the original material. Cedar shakes were not used in period construction.*

3. *Alternating or checkerboard shingles are not permitted.*

FINDING NO. 9: The proposed roof pitch on the addition is 9:12, which complies with the criteria, and it is the same pitch as the original residence. The shingles will be asphalt composition to match the existing roofing. The criteria are met.

- L. Massing. The square footage of the principal dwelling/house and any attached garage (not counting the basement) cannot exceed 125 percent of the average square footage of the adjacent homes (and any attached garage) on either side of the subject house, or 1,200 square feet, whichever is greater. For the purpose of this section, homes to the rear, or across the street, shall not be used as the basis of the square footage calculation. Homes on corner lots shall base their square footage on the one house and any attached garage adjacent to them. The square footage of the adjacent home will be based on actual measurement of all livable space in the house plus any attached garage (exclude crawlspaces or attic areas with less than five-foot vertical clearance plus all basement areas).

FINDING NO. 10: The proposed addition is 209 sq. ft. Per the massing calculations above, the existing residence, including the attached garage, is 1,784 sq. ft. The addition increases the square footage to 1,993 sq. ft. Per the Clackamas County Assessor's Office, and not including the basements (included in the applicant's submittal), the adjacent properties are 1,832 sq. ft. (1808 4th Ave.) and 1,358 sq. ft. (1862 4th Ave.). The average of these two is 1,595 sq. ft. and 125% of this average is 1,994 sq. ft. The proposed addition would not increase the residence to more than 125% of the adjacent residences. The criterion is met.

25.080 ADDITIONAL ARCHITECTURAL SPECIFICS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND REMODELING

Many houses in Willamette are rich in architectural detail. Certain architectural components are used in fairly specific ways. Standards:

- A. *Distinguishing original qualities defining a structure's character shall not be destroyed. Removal or alteration of historic (i.e., original) materials or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.*
- B. *Houses and other structures shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis or which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be avoided.*
- C. *Distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a structure, shall be maintained or restored, if possible.*
- D. *Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, whenever possible.*
- E. *In the event replacement is necessary, new materials should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.*
- F. *Alterations to the rear of a house, or to other portions not visible from the public right-of-way (exclusive of alleys), need not adhere to the design standards contained herein.*
- G. *Contemporary designs for alterations and additions would be acceptable if the design respects the building's original design, and it is compatible with the original scale, materials, window and door opening proportions of the structure.*
- H. *Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure could be restored.*

FINDING NO. 12: The proposed changes will not seek to create an earlier appearance. They will improve the aesthetics of the residence, but it will remain distinguishable from the historic residences in the neighborhood. The proposed addition is compatible with the scale, materials, and

window and door opening proportions of the original residence. In addition, the proposed addition is also compatible with the scale, materials, and window and door opening proportions of the historic residences in the neighborhood.

25.150 DESIGN MODIFICATION PROCEDURES

- A. *When an alternative(s) to the standards of this chapter is proposed, the decision making body (e.g., Historic Review Board) may grant a design modification in those cases where at least one of the following criteria is met:*
1. *The applicant can demonstrate by review of historical records or photographs that the alternative is correct and appropriate to the architecture in the Willamette Historic District of West Linn in 1890 – 1930 or is appropriate to the specific style of architecture proposed with no negative impacts to adjacent homes and the Historic District. Negative impacts shall be defined as loss of sunlight, loss of privacy compared to a design per this code, inappropriate scale or mass which visually overwhelms or is not deferential to the adjacent structure, particularly if it is a primary structure, etc.*
 2. *The applicant is incorporating exceptional 1890 – 1930 architecture into the building which overcompensates for an omission. The emphasis is upon superior design, detail, or workmanship which can be verified reviewing previous works of the architect or builder. There shall be no negative impacts to adjacent homes and the Historic District.*
 3. *The building placement, scale, lot coverage, setback or height fits the site and integrates well, with no negative impacts to adjacent structures and the Historic District.*
- B. *The provisions of Chapter 75 CDC, Variance, shall not apply.*

FINDING NO. 13: The applicant is requesting a modification from two of the required criteria. The first modification is to permit a rear yard setback of 18 feet rather than the required 20 feet. The second is to permit residing the house; changing it from vinyl siding to wood shingles. The standards require wood siding and permit shingles only in conjunction with wood siding.

In regards to the setback, staff finds that it satisfies (3) above. An 18' setback for the rear addition is appropriate for the site. Unlike most of the houses in the neighborhood, this residence has an attached garage that fronts 4th Avenue rather than is located in the alley (the alley loaded garages are generally located in the rear yard setback). There are no additional structures in the rear yard. At this point in time, there is also significant screening and the proposed addition will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way. In addition, the adjacent properties do not have living areas facing the addition.

For the siding, staff finds that it satisfies the following provision in (1), “the alternative is correct and appropriate to the architecture in the Willamette Historic District of West Linn in 1890 – 1930.” The applicant has provided staff with examples of residences in and near the District that have shingle siding. These demonstrate that residing the house from vinyl to wood shingle is appropriate for District.