



STAFF REPORT FOR THE HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD

FILE NUMBER: DR-11-12

HEARING DATE: September 20, 2011

REQUEST: New Garage Construction

**APPROVAL
CRITERIA:** Community Development Code (CDC) Chapter 25, Historic District

**STAFF REPORT
PREPARED BY:** Sara Javoronok, Associate Planner

Planning Director's Review _____

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant is proposing to construct a garage in the side yard of the lot at 1769 4th Avenue. The garage would be accessed from 4th Avenue since there is not an alley on this side of the street. The project is subject to the approval criteria in CDC Chapter 25, Historic District.

The subject property is located on the south side of 4th Avenue between 13th and 14th Streets. It is in the City's Willamette Neighborhood and local Willamette Historic District. Chapter 25 classified it as a "Secondary Structure" and a reconnaissance level survey of the neighborhood from 2006 classified it as non-contributing.

Staff finds that the applicant's proposal, supplemented with conditions of approval, meets the applicable criteria. Therefore, staff recommends approval.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
GENERAL INFORMATION.....	3
BACKGROUND.....	4
ANALYSIS	6
RECOMMENDATION.....	7

ADDENDUM

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS.....	8
--	---

EXHIBITS

HRB-1 AFFIDAVIT OF NOTICE.....	13
HRB-2 NOTICE MAILING PACKET.....	14
HRB-3 APPLICANT SUBMITTAL	18
HRB-4 HISTORIC SITE INVENTORY FORMS.....	24

GENERAL INFORMATION

- APPLICANT/
OWNER:** Sandi Gadow, 1769 4th Avenue, West Linn, OR 97068
- SITE LOCATION:** 1769 4th Ave.
- LEGAL
DESCRIPTION:** Clackamas County Assessor's Map 31E-02BD, Tax Lot 2500
- SITE SIZE:** 9,372 square feet
- ZONING:** R-10, Single Family Residential Detached
- COMP PLAN
DESIGNATION:** Medium Density Residential
- 120-DAY PERIOD:** The application was complete on August 24, 2011. Therefore, the 120-day application processing period ends on December 22, 2011.
- PUBLIC NOTICE:** Public notice was mailed to the Willamette Neighborhood Association and to affected property owners on August 31, 2011 and the application has been posted on the City's website. Therefore, notice requirements have been satisfied.

BACKGROUND

As previously noted, the property is located in the Willamette neighborhood and Willamette Historic District at 1769 4th Avenue, between 13th and 14th Streets.



Site Conditions. The lot currently accommodates a 1½ story single family house and a greenhouse. The property was included in the 2006 Reconnaissance Level Survey of the Willamette Falls Neighborhood Historic District. The survey form is attached as Exhibit HRB-4.

According to the historic surveys, the bungalow was constructed c. 1915. The Sanborn maps date it later; it does not appear on the 1925 map, rather it first appears on the 1950 map. It is 1½ stories with multiple rooflines from additions. The additions have decreased the structure's integrity and contribute substantially to its designation as a non-contributing residence. The only accessory structure on the lot is a greenhouse to the east of the residence. There is currently a gravel driveway that the owner accesses from 4th Avenue.



Front elevation



Front and side elevation, existing gravel driveway



Gravel driveway, existing greenhouse, side elevation



Side elevation, gravel driveway

Project Description. The applicant is proposing to construct a garage 21' 8" x 16' feet in size. It would be accessed from the existing gravel driveway. An asphalt roof and horizontal lap wood siding are proposed (see Exhibit HRB-3). The proposed garage door is "carriage style" and from the Township Collection by Northwest Door. A window and door are proposed for the west elevation, facing the house. The applicant has agreed to a set of 2' x 3' paired single hung fiberglass windows. The entry door is a steel door with a single light window.

Surrounding Land Use. The parcel is surrounded by residential properties. Those on the south side of Fourth Avenue are zoned R-10, while those on the north are zoned R-5.

DIRECTION FROM SITE	LAND USE	ZONING
North	Single-family residential detached and duplex	R-5
East	Single-family residential detached	R-10
South	Single-family residential detached	R-10
West	Single-family residential detached	R-10



Public comments. To date, staff has not received any comments from the public.

ANALYSIS

CDC Chapter 25, Historic District, applies to this project. Specifically, the criteria in Section 25.060, and 25.070 are applicable.

The applicant is proposing a new garage in the side yard of the property. Typically, garages in the Willamette Historic District are accessed from an alley, however, there is not an alley in this block. The proposed garage will be accessed from 4th Avenue using the existing gravel driveway. It is set back the required five feet on the side yard, and over 20 feet in the front yard, equal to the setback of the dominant front façade.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application subject to the following conditions:

1. Site Plan and elevations. With the exception of modifications required by these conditions, the project shall conform to the plans labeled “Street View Site Plan” and “Sections Elevations Foundation Plan” in Exhibit HRB-3.
2. Windows. The windows on the west elevation shall be a pair of 2’ x 3’ fiberglass single hung windows as described in the applicant’s narrative in Exhibit HRB-3. The window trim shall be at least four and one-half inches wide or the same as the original trim on the residence.

Notes to applicant.

- Expiration of Approval. This approval shall expire three years from the effective date of this decision.
- Additional Permits Required. Your project may require the following additional permits:
 - Public improvement permit: contact Pat in Engineering at (503) 723-5501 or prich@westlinnoregon.gov
 - Public works permit: contact Pat in Engineering at (503) 723-5501 or prich@westlinnoregon.gov
 - On-Site Utilities: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov. (Electrical permits are through Clackamas County, not the City of West Linn.)
 - Building permit: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov.
 - Final inspection, for occupancy: Call the Building Division’s Inspection Line at (503) 722-5509.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS

DR-11-12

CHAPTER 25, HISTORIC DISTRICT

25.060 CRITERIA FOR EXTERIOR ALTERATION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION

- A. *Except as provided pursuant to CDC 25.100, no person may alter the exterior of any structure in an Historic District in a manner as to affect its exterior appearance, nor may any new structure be constructed in an Historic District, unless the site and evaluation drawings are approved by the Historic Review Board.*
- B. *Exterior remodeling as governed by this chapter shall include any change or alteration in design or other exterior treatment excluding painting.*
- C. *For new home construction or exterior alterations of structures in an Historic District, the criteria to be used by the Historic Review Board in reaching the decision shall include the following:*
 - 1. *The purpose of the Historic District as set forth in CDC 25.040.*
 - 2. *The policies of the West Linn Comprehensive Plan.*
 - 3. *The economic use of the structure in an Historic District and the reasonableness of the proposed alteration and their relationship to the public interest in the structure's or landmark's preservation or renovation. (Applicable to commercial only.)*
 - 4. *The value and significance of the structure or landmark in an Historic District. (Applicable to remodeling only.)*
 - 5. *The physical condition of the structure or landmark in an Historic District. (Applicable to remodeling only.)*
 - 6. *The general compatibility of exterior design, arrangement, proportion, detail, scale, color, texture and materials proposed to be used with an existing structure in an Historic District.*
 - 7. *Pertinent aesthetic factors as designed by the Historic Review Board.*
 - 8. *Economic, social, environmental and energy consequences related to LCDC Goal No. 5. (Ord. 1594 § 1 (Exh. A), 2010)*

FINDING NO. 1: The applicant's proposal will be reviewed by the Historic Review Board. Staff finds that the value, significance, physical condition, compatibility, and aesthetic impacts of this non-contributing residence have been considered and will be impacted as little as possible. The criteria are met.

25.070 APPROVAL CRITERIA FOR REMODELS, NEW HOME AND ACCESSORY STRUCTURE CONSTRUCTION

- B. Siting.
 - 1. Front yard:
 - a. *The front yard setback shall be the distance measured from the front property line to the dominant vertical face of the building, exclusive of any porches or front landings, equal to the average of the front setbacks of adjacent homes. For corner lots, the setback shall be the average between the adjacent house to the side and 20 feet.*
 - b. *Unenclosed porches with no living space above may encroach six feet further from the dominant vertical face of the building.*

2. Side yard: Five feet shall be the standard; however, where adjacent structures encroach into the required side yard, the Planning Director may reduce one of the side yards to a minimum of three feet to center a new structure between existing buildings, provided no space between buildings is reduced below eight feet. To encourage sidewall variation, "pop outs," including chimneys, may intrude 18 inches into side yard setback.
3. Side street: 10 feet for both developed and undeveloped street. To encourage sidewall variation, "pop outs," including chimneys, may intrude 24 inches into side street yard setback after every 400 square feet of sidewall.
4. Rear yard: The rear yard setback shall be a minimum of 20 feet, except for accessory structures (non-dwelling or non-accessory dwelling units (ADU)), which may be sited to within three feet of the side or rear property lines. See section on ADUs for ADU setbacks.
5. Orientation: New home construction on corner lots must orient the front of the house to the avenue and not the street.
6. Lot coverage: 50 percent. Unlike the rest of West Linn, lot coverage shall apply to the new and remodeled primary dwellings, attached and detached garages, all accessory buildings and ADUs. Decks, paved and impermeable surfaces (patios and driveways etc.) shall not be included. Underlying zone (e.g., R-5) lot coverage shall not apply.

FINDING NO. 2: For #1, the front yard setback of the proposed garage is 23' 7 1/4", measured from the front property line to the dominant vertical face of the building. For #2, the side yard setback for the proposed garage is five feet, which is the required setback. Criterion 3 does not apply. For #4, the lot depth is 125' and the rear of the proposed structure will be approximately 75' from the rear lot line, far exceeding the 20' required. Criterion #5 does not apply. For #6, lot coverage, the total is approximately 20 percent, which is far less than the 50 percent permitted.

C. *Parking. Parking in Willamette Town traditionally was handled from the alleys or along the "streets" (as opposed to avenues). Detached garages along the alleys or "streets" characterizes many homes in the district. Alleys were established to provide for access to off-street parking, including garages.*

1. *Standards, garages.*
 - a. *Garages shall be accessed from the alley. Where no alley exists, access to a garage may be from the street.*
 - b. *Garage remodels and new construction must match house or existing garage building materials. Damaged or deteriorated non-conforming garages must be reconstructed/relocated in accordance with this code where remodeling or rebuilding costs exceed 50 percent of the full replacement cost in current dollars.*
 - c. *Typically, the garage roof pitch was not as steep as the house. Some architectural styles of garages have lower pitched roofs. Garage roof pitch shall not exceed house roof pitch.*
 - d. *Garages located within the rear yard may have a zero-foot side yard setback so long as it is constructed with one-hour fire walls, with no openings in wall and no overhang, per City building standards. The three-foot rear setback shall still apply.*
2. *Standards, parking.*
 - a. *No residential lot shall be converted solely to parking use.*
 - b. *All vehicle access and storage (i.e., boats, camper shells, trails, recreational vehicles, etc.) shall be stored or parked in the rear of the property as opposed to the front or side yards.*
 - c. *On corner lots or where homes face streets, the parking and storage shall be located on the alley side of the house.*
 - d. *No front yard curb cut shall be established unless it is determined by the City Engineer that all reasonable access alternatives have been exhausted.*

- e. *The parking provisions of CDC 26.050(B) shall apply to any non-conforming uses of a structure (i.e., bed and breakfast). These provisions would not apply to General Commercial zone uses in the Historic District.*

FINDING NO. 3: In regards to Section 25.070 C(1), the proposed garage will be accessed from 4th Avenue since there is not an alley present on this side of 4th Avenue. The proposed materials will match the materials on the exterior of the residence. The pitch of the garage roof is 6:12, which is comparable to the residence. This pitch is appropriate for a bungalow, compared to a Queen Anne or Victorian residence, which typically have higher pitched roofs. The garage is not located in the rear yard, so a five-foot side yard setback is required. Section 25.070 C(2) does not apply. The applicable criteria are met.

D. *Building height.* (Note: Buildings in Willamette Town vary in height; most evident are one and one-half story Victorians and bungalows. Some buildings reach two stories, and there are several single-story structures as well.)

1. *No building shall exceed the height of 28 feet to the dominant gable or roof ridgeline as measured per Chapter 02 CDC. This restriction shall apply regardless of the existing or finished grade of the site.*
2. *In order to transition in scale, new houses that are taller than homes adjacent to them must have the predominant roof ridgeline extending perpendicular to the front property line so that the roof slopes down on the sides to effect that transition. Dormers are allowed on that sloping roof area facing the adjacent home(s) but cannot constitute more than 25 percent of the roof as measured lineally or horizontally (e.g., if roof is 50 feet long the dormer(s) cannot be more than 25 percent of that distance or 12.5 feet long in total). Also, the dormer height must be at least two feet below the gable ridgeline height.*
3. *Cupolas and towers are not excluded from the aforementioned height limitation.*
4. *Alteration of roof pitches or raising or lowering a structure's permanent elevation, when constructing a foundation, shall be avoided.*
5. *The original height of the structure's front elevation shall be preserved. Additions to the rear portion of the house shall be allowed where those additions do not compromise the character of the front elevation or the scale or significantly modify the mass of the house as seen from the right-of-way.*

FINDING NO. 4: Criteria 2-5 do not apply. The proposed garage will be 13 feet tall. The applicable criterion is met.

E. *Building shapes and sizes.*

1. *No building on a 50-foot-wide lot shall exceed 35 feet in overall width. Lots with a 65-foot width or greater may have a building width of 40 feet plus the porches, eaves or veranda extensions so that the maximum total width is 47 feet.*
2. *End walls (street facing) shall be designed with consideration of scale and aesthetic character of the main facade.*
3. *Buildings shall avoid a horizontal orientation in their roof and window designs, unless the design can be shown to match the original roof design or approximate the design of nearby structures and styles.*
4. *Sidewalls on the side of new homes shall have a minimum 18-inch "pop out" or indent after every 400 square feet of sidewall measured laterally/horizontally. The "pop out" or indent shall be at least six feet wide and shall be at least nine feet tall. (Bay windows could qualify). Sidewalls on the side street side of new homes shall have minimum 24-inch "pop*

out” or indent after every 400 square feet of sidewall measured laterally/horizontally. “Pop outs” may intrude into the setback area.

FINDING NO. 5: For #1, the proposed building is 16 feet in width, which is far less than the maximum permitted. Criteria 2-4 do not apply. The applicable criterion is met.

H. Windows. Window sizes vary considerably in the district. Windows on the primary and secondary structures are wood sash, usually a double hung type. Victorian styled structures typically have narrower, vertically-oriented windows. Bungalow styled structures from the “Craftsman” era (1905 – 1930) may have wider windows with mullions across the top of larger paned areas. Most windows have fairly wide trim boards, usually five inches. Standards:

- 1. Historic window sashes and frames shall be repaired rather than replaced unless the approval authority determines that repair is not possible. In that case, the replacement shall match the old window sash and frame in design, texture, materials, and other visual qualities. Existing replacement windows shall be replaced with windows that match the original window in design, texture, and other visual qualities, and, where possible, materials, as determined by the approval authority. Windows in new construction and additions shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the structure. Wood windows are preferred.*
- 2. Aluminum windows are prohibited unless they were the original materials and meet dimensional standards.*
- 3. Windows shall be surrounded by exterior trim on the top and sides; window trim shall be at least four and one-half inches minimum width unless the original window was less.*
- 4. Window replacements shall match the visual qualities of original windows.*
- 5. Storm windows should follow the standards for windows and shall have a mullion that matches the divide between the upper and lower window sashes. The color should match underlying trim.*

FINDING NO. 6: The applicant has agreed to install paired single hung 2’ x 3’ fiberglass windows on the west elevation. This is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the garage and primary residence. The trim is not identified and staff recommends a condition stating that the trim on the windows shall be at least four and one-half inches wide or match the original trim on the residence. Criteria 2, 4, and 5 do not apply. The applicable criteria are met.

I. Entryways. Porches are a key architectural feature on most homes in Willamette Town. Frequently, the porch and entryway creates a dominant architectural feature on the main facade. On corner lots, the entry usually faces the east-west avenues. Front doors are often notably detailed; many contain glass panes or carvings. Standards:

- 1. Buildings shall have a permanently protected entry. Awnings are not permanent protection.*
- 2. All main entrances should face the avenues.*
- 3. Flush (flat) doors are prohibited.*
- 4. Doors with windowed areas are recommended. Front porch enclosure of any dwelling unit may not be enclosed. Back porches may be enclosed.*

FINDING NO. 7: There are two entries to the garage. On the north, or front, elevation is a carriage-style garage door that will be from Northwest Door’s Township Collection. On the west, or side, elevation is a steel man door with a single light. The criteria are met.

J. Siding and exterior finish. Standards:

- 1. Horizontal wood siding shall be the primary exterior finish.*

2. *Shingles should only be used in conjunction with horizontal wood siding.*
3. *Single color exteriors are discouraged. Stained exteriors are not recommended.*

FINDING NO. 8: The proposed horizontal wood lap siding will match the exterior of the residence. Criteria 2 and 3 do not apply. The applicable criterion is met.

K. Roofscape Standards:

1. *Roofs shall have a pitch of at least 8:12 to maintain the pattern of steep roof pitches. The Historic Review Board will consider deviations from the 8:12 to 12:12 standard for additions to the main body of the house so long as it is consistent with a particular architectural style.*
2. *Roofing materials should be asphalt composite shingles. Milled cedar shingles may only be used if they are replacing milled cedar shingles or if they were the original material. Cedar shakes were not used in period construction.*
3. *Alternating or checkerboard shingles are not permitted.*

FINDING NO. 9: The roof pitch is addressed above in C. It has a shallow pitch that is appropriate with for a bungalow residence. The shingles will be asphalt composite to match the roof on the existing house. The applicable criteria are met.

M. Foundations and basements.

1. *Foundations may be poured concrete or brick faced concrete and shall be exposed at least one to two and one-half feet on the front elevation (depending on whether the lot is an uphill or downhill lot) to accommodate front steps and/or a raised porch. Final foundation grade will impact the height of the house. Misrepresentations or errors in determining the height of the house due to site conditions and height of foundation wall cannot be used to justify any house heights in excess of the allowed height. No backfilling is allowed against a foundation wall to increase grades.*
2. *Basements shall be defined as livable or functional space below the main floor of the principal dwelling/house which is exposed above grade a maximum height of two feet. Windows and window wells are permitted but not on the front elevation. The square footage of the basement shall not count in building square footage (re: ADU), mass calculations, etc*

FINDING NO. 10: The foundation shall be poured concrete and exposed at least one-foot. Criteria 2 does not apply. The applicable criterion is met.