



**STAFF REPORT
FOR THE HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD**

FILE NUMBER: DR-11-05

HEARING DATE: June 7, 2011

REQUEST: Accessory Structure

**APPROVAL
CRITERIA:** Community Development Code (CDC) Chapter 25, Historic District

**STAFF REPORT
PREPARED BY:** Sara Javoronok, Associate Planner

Planning Director's Initials 

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant is proposing an accessory structure in the rear yard of 1883 6th Avenue. The project is subject to the approval criteria in Chapter 25, Historic District.

The subject house is located on 6th Avenue to the west of the intersection of 6th Avenue and 12th Street. It is in the City's Willamette Neighborhood and local Willamette Historic District. It is also in the National Register listed Willamette Falls Neighborhood Historic District. In 2010, the Clackamas County Historic Review Board reviewed and approved a side gabled dormer addition for this property, which is now complete.

Staff finds that the applicant's proposal, supplemented with conditions of approval, meets the applicable criteria. Therefore, staff recommends approval.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
GENERAL INFORMATION.....	3
BACKGROUND.....	4
ANALYSIS	6
RECOMMENDATION.....	6

ADDENDUM

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS.....	8
--	---

EXHIBITS

HRB-1 AFFIDAVIT OF NOTICE	13
HRB-2 NOTICE MAILING PACKET.....	14
HRB-3 APPLICANT SUBMITTAL	19
HRB-4 HISTORIC SITE INVENTORY FORMS	25

GENERAL INFORMATION

APPLICANT: Dean Mackeson, 25450 Swiftshore Drive, West Linn, OR 97068

OWNER: Dave Becker, 1883 6th Avenue, West Linn, OR 97068

SITE LOCATION: 1883 6th Ave.

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: Clackamas County Assessor's Map 31E-02BA, Tax Lot 6401

SITE SIZE: 5,000 square feet

ZONING: R-5, Single Family Residential Detached and Attached Duplex

COMP PLAN DESIGNATION: Medium Density Residential

120-DAY PERIOD: The application was complete on May 9, 2011. Therefore, the 120-day application processing period ends on September 6, 2011.

PUBLIC NOTICE: Public notice was mailed to the Willamette Neighborhood Association and to affected property owners on May 23, 2011 and the application has been posted on the City's website. Therefore, notice requirements have been satisfied.

BACKGROUND

As previously noted, the property is located in the Willamette neighborhood at 1883 6th Avenue, near the intersection of 6th Avenue and 12th Street. It is in the local Willamette Historic District and the National Register Willamette Falls Historic District.



Site Conditions. The lot currently accommodates a 1 ½ story single family house and associated landscaping. There is an existing 6-foot fence in the rear yard. (see the following photographs). There are no other structures on the lot.

The property was included in the 1984 Clackamas County Cultural Resources Inventory and the 2006 reconnaissance level survey of the Willamette Falls Neighborhood Historic District. The survey forms are attached. The house appears on the 1900 Sanborn map with a footprint that is the same as its current footprint. The 1900 and 1911 Sanborn maps show a 1 ½ story structure in the west portion of the rear yard. The 1925 and 1950 Sanborn maps show a 1 ½ story structure in the east portion of the rear yard.

Per the surveys, the residence was constructed c. 1900 in the Queen Anne style. Elements of this style include the truncated hip roof with multiple gables, the cutaway bay window with brackets, and the turned porch posts. The majority of the house is sided with cement asbestos siding. On the rear façade, this siding has been removed to expose the historic wood siding. The owner's long-term plan is to remove the remainder of the cement asbestos siding and restore the historic wood siding. There are extensions on the house, including one on the east side that extends to the rear and a small extension on the west side that is below the proposed dormer.



Front façade



Rear façade/yard



Proposed accessory structure location, rear yard



View from alley

Project Description. The applicant is proposing a 216 square foot accessory structure in the rear yard for use as a home office. The proposed structure would have a 3-tab asphalt composition shingle roof with a 10:12 pitch to match the house. The proposed siding is shiplap to match the exposed historic siding on the rear addition. There are two proposed entries. One faces the rear façade of the house and is a 1 light wood door. The window will be fixed with 4 lights. French doors are proposed for the second entry, which faces west. Three 1/1 light windows are proposed for the structure. One is on the façade facing the rear of the house. The other two are paired and are on the façade facing the alley (see Exhibit HRB-3, Site Plan 01 and Becker Studio Plan).

Surrounding Land Use. The parcel is surrounded by single-family homes that are zoned R-5. In addition, Willamette Primary School is located nearby on 12th Street.

DIRECTION FROM SITE	LAND USE	ZONING
North	Single-family residential	R-5
East	Single-family residential	R-5
South	Single-family residential	R-5
West	Single-family residential	R-5



Public comments. Staff has not received any comments from the public.

Comments from outside agencies. Staff has not received comments from outside agencies.

ANALYSIS

CDC Chapter 25, Historic District, applies to this property. Specifically, the criteria in Section 25.060, 25.070, and 25.080 are applicable.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application subject to the following conditions:

1. Site plan and elevations. With the exception of modifications required by these conditions, the project shall conform to the plans labeled Site Plan 01 and Becker Studio Plan in Exhibit HRB-3.
2. Lighting. Any lighting shall be shielded from the adjacent properties.

Notes to applicant.

- Expiration of Approval. This approval shall expire three years from the effective date of this decision.

- Additional Permits Required. Your project may require the following additional permits:
 - On-Site Utilities: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov. (Electrical permits are through Clackamas County, not the City of West Linn.)

 - Building permit: contact the Building Division at (503) 656-4211, jnomie@westlinnoregon.gov.

 - Final inspection, for occupancy: Call the Building Division's Inspection Line at (503) 722-5509.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS AND ASSOCIATED SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS

DR-11-05

CHAPTER 25, HISTORIC DISTRICT

25.060 CRITERIA FOR EXTERIOR ALTERATION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION

- A. *Except as provided pursuant to CDC 25.100, no person may alter the exterior of any structure in an Historic District in a manner as to affect its exterior appearance, nor may any new structure be constructed in an Historic District, unless the site and evaluation drawings are approved by the Historic Review Board.*
- B. *Exterior remodeling as governed by this chapter shall include any change or alteration in design or other exterior treatment excluding painting.*
- C. *For new home construction or exterior alterations of structures in an Historic District, the criteria to be used by the Historic Review Board in reaching the decision shall include the following:*
 - 1. *The purpose of the Historic District as set forth in CDC 25.040.*
 - 2. *The policies of the West Linn Comprehensive Plan.*
 - 3. *The economic use of the structure in an Historic District and the reasonableness of the proposed alteration and their relationship to the public interest in the structure's or landmark's preservation or renovation. (Applicable to commercial only.)*
 - 4. *The value and significance of the structure or landmark in an Historic District. (Applicable to remodeling only.)*
 - 5. *The physical condition of the structure or landmark in an Historic District. (Applicable to remodeling only.)*
 - 6. *The general compatibility of exterior design, arrangement, proportion, detail, scale, color, texture and materials proposed to be used with an existing structure in an Historic District.*
 - 7. *Pertinent aesthetic factors as designed by the Historic Review Board.*
 - 8. *Economic, social, environmental and energy consequences related to LCDC Goal No. 5.*

FINDING NO. 1: The applicant's proposal will be reviewed by the Historic Review Board. Staff finds that the value, significance, physical condition, compatibility, and aesthetic impacts of this contributing residence will not be compromised by the proposed addition. The criteria are met.

25.070 APPROVAL CRITERIA FOR REMODELS, NEW HOME AND ACCESSORY STRUCTURE CONSTRUCTION

- B. Siting.
 - 1. Front yard:
 - a. *The front yard setback shall be the distance measured from the front property line to the dominant vertical face of the building, exclusive of any porches or front landings, equal to the average of the front setbacks of adjacent homes. For corner lots, the setback shall be the average between the adjacent house to the side and 20 feet.*
 - b. *Unenclosed porches with no living space above may encroach six feet further from the dominant vertical face of the building.*
 - 2. Side yard: *Five feet shall be the standard; however, where adjacent structures encroach into the required side yard, the Planning Director may reduce one of the side yards to a*

minimum of three feet to center a new structure between existing buildings, provided no space between buildings is reduced below eight feet. To encourage sidewall variation, "pop outs," including chimneys, may intrude 18 inches into side yard setback.

3. *Side street: 10 feet for both developed and undeveloped street. To encourage sidewall variation, "pop outs," including chimneys, may intrude 24 inches into side street yard setback after every 400 square feet of sidewall.*
4. *Rear yard: The rear yard setback shall be a minimum of 20 feet, except for accessory structures (non-dwelling or non-accessory dwelling units (ADU)), which may be sited to within three feet of the side or rear property lines. See section on ADUs for ADU setbacks.*
5. *Orientation: New home construction on corner lots must orient the front of the house to the avenue and not the street.*
6. *Lot coverage: 50 percent. Unlike the rest of West Linn, lot coverage shall apply to the new and remodeled primary dwellings, attached and detached garages, all accessory buildings and ADUs. Decks, paved and impermeable surfaces (patios and driveways etc.) shall not be included. Underlying zone (e.g., R-5) lot coverage shall not apply.*

FINDING NO. 2: Criteria 1-3 and 5 do not apply. The proposed accessory structure would be set back 5' from the side property line and 3' from the rear property line (see Exhibit HRB 3, Site Plan). The proposed accessory structure complies with the required lot coverage. The existing structure is 1,132 square feet and the proposed accessory structure is 216 square feet for a total of 1,348 square feet, which is 27 percent and less than the 50 percent maximum that is permitted in the historic district. The criteria are met.

D. Building height. (Note: Buildings in Willamette Town vary in height; most evident are one and one-half story Victorians and bungalows. Some buildings reach two stories, and there are several single-story structures as well.)

1. *No building shall exceed the height of 28 feet to the dominant gable or roof ridgeline as measured per Chapter 02 CDC. This restriction shall apply regardless of the existing or finished grade of the site.*
2. *In order to transition in scale, new houses that are taller than homes adjacent to them must have the predominant roof ridgeline extending perpendicular to the front property line so that the roof slopes down on the sides to effect that transition. Dormers are allowed on that sloping roof area facing the adjacent home(s) but cannot constitute more than 25 percent of the roof as measured lineally or horizontally (e.g., if roof is 50 feet long the dormer(s) cannot be more than 25 percent of that distance or 12.5 feet long in total). Also, the dormer height must be at least two feet below the gable ridgeline height.*
3. *Cupolas and towers are not excluded from the aforementioned height limitation.*
4. *Alteration of roof pitches or raising or lowering a structure's permanent elevation, when constructing a foundation, shall be avoided.*
5. *The original height of the structure's front elevation shall be preserved. Additions to the rear portion of the house shall be allowed where those additions do not compromise the character of the front elevation or the scale or significantly modify the mass of the house as seen from the right-of-way.*

FINDING NO. 3: Criteria 2-4 do not apply. The proposed accessory structure is 16' feet tall. The accessory structure will not compromise character of the front elevation and will not significantly modify the mass of the house as seen from the right-of-way. The applicable criteria are met.

E. Building shapes and sizes.

1. No building on a 50-foot-wide lot shall exceed 35 feet in overall width. Lots with a 65-foot width or greater may have a building width of 40 feet plus the porches, eaves or veranda extensions so that the maximum total width is 47 feet.
2. End walls (street facing) shall be designed with consideration of scale and aesthetic character of the main facade.
3. Buildings shall avoid a horizontal orientation in their roof and window designs, unless the design can be shown to match the original roof design or approximate the design of nearby structures and styles.
4. Sidewalls on the side of new homes shall have a minimum 18-inch "pop out" or indent after every 400 square feet of sidewall measured laterally/horizontally. The "pop out" or indent shall be at least six feet wide and shall be at least nine feet tall. (Bay windows could qualify). Sidewalls on the side street side of new homes shall have minimum 24-inch "pop out" or indent after every 400 square feet of sidewall measured laterally/horizontally. "Pop outs" may intrude into the setback area.

FINDING NO. 4: The proposed accessory structure is 12' in width and 18' in length. The sidewalls are not large enough to require a pop out. The applicable criteria are met.

H. Windows. Window sizes vary considerably in the district. Windows on the primary and secondary structures are wood sash, usually a double hung type. Victorian styled structures typically have narrower, vertically-oriented windows. Bungalow styled structures from the "Craftsman" era (1905 – 1930) may have wider windows with mullions across the top of larger paned areas. Most windows have fairly wide trim boards, usually five inches. Standards:

1. Historic window sashes and frames shall be repaired rather than replaced unless the approval authority determines that repair is not possible. In that case, the replacement shall match the old window sash and frame in design, texture, materials, and other visual qualities. Existing replacement windows shall be replaced with windows that match the original window in design, texture, and other visual qualities, and, where possible, materials, as determined by the approval authority. Windows in new construction and additions shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the structure. Wood windows are preferred.
2. Aluminum windows are prohibited unless they were the original materials and meet dimensional standards.
3. Windows shall be surrounded by exterior trim on the top and sides; window trim shall be at least four and one-half inches minimum width unless the original window was less.
4. Window replacements shall match the visual qualities of original windows.
5. Storm windows should follow the standards for windows and shall have a mullion that matches the divide between the upper and lower window sashes. The color should match underlying trim.

FINDING NO. 5: The applicant is proposing three recycled/salvaged windows that are 1/1 light. The proportions of the windows would be consistent with the existing windows. The trim will be 4" and will match the existing trim on the rear. One window would be on the elevation facing the rear façade of the house and the other two would be paired and on the rear elevation facing the alley. The criteria are met.

I. Entryways. Porches are a key architectural feature on most homes in Willamette Town. Frequently, the porch and entryway creates a dominant architectural feature on the main

facade. On corner lots, the entry usually faces the east-west avenues. Front doors are often notably detailed; many contain glass panes or carvings. Standards:

- 1. Buildings shall have a permanently protected entry. Awnings are not permanent protection.*
- 2. All main entrances should face the avenues.*
- 3. Flush (flat) doors are prohibited.*
- 4. Doors with windowed areas are recommended. Front porch enclosure of any dwelling unit may not be enclosed. Back porches may be enclosed.*

FINDING NO. 6: The applicant is proposing two entries. One is on the elevation that faces the rear of the house and would be a 1 light wood door with true divided and fixed lights. The second entry faces the west and the rear yard. The applicant is proposing French doors with multiple fixed and true divided lights. The trim would be the same width as the window trim. The criteria are met.

J. Siding and exterior finish. Standards:

- 1. Horizontal wood siding shall be the primary exterior finish.*
- 2. Shingles should only be used in conjunction with horizontal wood siding.*
- 3. Single color exteriors are discouraged. Stained exteriors are not recommended.*

FINDING NO. 7: The applicant is proposing 6" horizontal shiplap wood siding for the accessory structure. Shingles are not proposed. The criteria are met.

K. Roofscape. Standards:

- 1. Roofs shall have a pitch of at least 8:12 to maintain the pattern of steep roof pitches. The Historic Review Board will consider deviations from the 8:12 to 12:12 standard for additions to the main body of the house so long as it is consistent with a particular architectural style.*
- 2. Roofing materials should be asphalt composite shingles. Milled cedar shingles may only be used if they are replacing milled cedar shingles or if they were the original material. Cedar shakes were not used in period construction.*
- 3. Alternating or checkerboard shingles are not permitted.*

FINDING NO. 8: The proposed roof is 10:12, which is equal to, but not greater than, the roof pitch of the house. The proposed roof is 3-tab asphalt composition shingle and will match the existing roof. The criteria are met.

25.080 ADDITIONAL ARCHITECTURAL SPECIFICS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND REMODELING

Many houses in Willamette are rich in architectural detail. Certain architectural components are used in fairly specific ways. Standards:

- A. Distinguishing original qualities defining a structure's character shall not be destroyed. Removal or alteration of historic (i.e., original) materials or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.*
- B. Houses and other structures shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis or which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be avoided.*
- C. Distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a structure, shall be maintained or restored, if possible.*
- D. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, whenever possible.*
- E. In the event replacement is necessary, new materials should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.*
- F. Alterations to the rear of a house, or to other portions not visible from the public right-of-way (exclusive of alleys), need not adhere to the design standards contained herein.*

- G. *Contemporary designs for alterations and additions would be acceptable if the design respects the building's original design, and it is compatible with the original scale, materials, window and door opening proportions of the structure.*
- H. *Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure could be restored.*

FINDING NO. 9: The proposed accessory structure will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way. The proposed design respects the house's original design and is compatible with the house's scale, materials, and windows and door openings. The criteria are met.