

## Memorandum

Date: 9/1/2015

To: Russell Axelrod, Mayor  
Members, West Linn City Council

From: Don Otterman, Interim City Manager

cc: Elissa Preston, HR Manager  
Kirsten Wyatt, Assistant City Manager

Subject: City manager recruitment process options

---

### **Background**

There are three different processes that cities can use to recruit and hire a new city manager. Each process comes with its own opportunities and challenges; it is up to the city council to evaluate each process and determine which one will work best for West Linn.

### **Timeline**

This memorandum is shared in advance of the September 14, 2015 city council meeting, at which time a discussion about the city manager recruitment process will occur, and the city council will hopefully provide recommendation on which recruitment process to pursue.

The three options are detailed below for councilor review and consideration. A staff recommendation and next steps are also included for the September 14 discussion.

### **Options**

#### *1. Internal promotion*

- An internal promotion occurs when there is a current city employee that the city council believes is qualified for and is interested in serving as the city manager.

#### *2. Internal recruitment*

- An internal recruitment is managed by the City of West Linn Human Resources department. While the city HR department frequently manages recruitment and hiring processes, searching for a city manager is a unique process.
- The city manager ultimately will oversee the HR department, and so an internal recruitment process can be more challenging, as it can seem as though the HR department is hiring their own boss.

### 3. *External recruitment*

- An external recruitment is managed by a private firm that specializes in executive search and placements. A request for proposals (RFP) is issued, and interested firms submit proposals for the council to consider. There are many components to the search process that could be included in the RFP.
- For example, some recruitment firms offer city council team building and leadership coaching to help plan for the future and develop a city manager job description that the entire council supports.
- And, the RFP can be drafted to include items of specific value to the West Linn City Council, including citizen participation in the city manager recruitment process, or a specific focus on the scope of the recruitment (regional or national).

### **Budget Impact**

Costs for an external recruitment with a national scope vary based on the consultant, although the median cost for a recent Oregon city manager recruitment was \$26,000 (see attachment).

### **Recommendation**

It is my recommendation that city staff, working closely with the city council, develop an RFP for an external recruitment process. This would ensure that the specific needs and interests of the city council are met during the city manager search.

### **Next Steps**

If the city council concurs that an external recruitment be conducted, I suggest the following timeline:

- September 14: Direct the city staff to prepare an RFP, and designate two city councilors to act as the liaisons to the RFP process; liaisons work with staff the week of the 14<sup>th</sup> on an RFP draft.
- September 21: City council approve RFP
- September 28: Issue RFP.
- November 2: Consultant proposals due to the city.
- November 3: Election day
- November 9: Select the recruitment firm and direct staff to execute the contract
- November & December: City council work with recruitment firm on development of job description and recruitment process
- January 11: Begin advertisement for city manager position

### **Attachments**

- City of Salem city manager recruitment cost comparison
- Sample RFPs:
  - *Hood River*
  - *Scappoose*

**City of Salem - City Manager - 2015**

<b>Executive Search Firm</b>	<b>Fee</b>	<b>Additional Expenses</b>	<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>Guarantee</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>References</b>
<b>Prothman - Issaquah WA</b>	\$18,500	\$5,900 - \$8,000; not including candidate travel expenses	\$26,500	2 year guarantee with no fee; plus additional expenses.	10-14 weeks	<u>City Manager:</u> City of Scappoose WA, City of McMinnville City of Lake Oswego City of Lebanon <u>HR Director:</u> City of Salem
<b>Bob Murray &amp; Associate - Rosevill CA</b>	\$17,500 including 3 days of meetings on site	\$7,500 include trave expenses and misc services	\$25,000	1 year guarantee at no cost; plus additional expenses.	16 weeks	City of Martinez CA, City of Pico Rivera, CA  City of Lake Oswego; Police Chief Home Forward, OR CEO/Executive Director
<b>Waldron - Seattle, Portland, San Francisco</b>	\$26,000	pre-approved expenditures over \$1,500 include travel expenses and misc services	\$27,500; 3 equal installments during the search	6 months search; cost-sharing basis plus 1/3 of original search fee	11 weeks	City of Hillsboro  City of Wilsonville
<b>Colin Baenziger &amp; Associates - Daytona Beach Shores, FL</b>	\$23,250 includes all expenses and costs	\$125.00 per hr beyond scope of proposal not including candidates travel expenses.	\$23,250 plus	1 year guarantee at no cost, even if conditions change, 2nd yr Expenses only	12 weeks	City of Bellevue, WA City of Scottsdale, AZ Clackamas County  Oregon City

# City of Hood River

## City Manager Recruiting Contractor Selection

Update 8-9-13

- **Request For Proposal**

- RFP language is included in this package.
- Research of firms completed, questions refined at group meeting and RFP distributed to 14 professional recruitment firms.
- As of Friday the 9<sup>th</sup>, Seven companies have committed to submit packages, three have declined due to full schedules, and we are waiting for four firms to respond.
- See the attached status sheet for details.
- Proposals are due early in week of the 12<sup>th</sup>. Downselection planned for 19<sup>th</sup>.

- **Schedule**

- Request for proposals sent out on the 6<sup>th</sup>
- Proposal (or updates) due by the 13<sup>th</sup>, leaving the rest of the week for follow up questions prior to downselection.
- Next selection sub-committee meeting the 19<sup>th</sup>. Downselection to top 3.
- Top 3 firm presentations in Hood River. Goal is to complete by Aug 23<sup>rd</sup>, but that might be too aggressive. **Expectation is that this will be open to the public.**
- Recommendation to City Council by committee after presentations. Possibly can be complete by meeting on Monday Aug 26<sup>th</sup> might slip to meeting on Monday September 9<sup>th</sup>.

- **Questions and Open Issues**

- League of Cities indicates that they do offer a facilitation service. Cost is lower (\$8.5K instead of \$20-30K). Level of Service is lower, work for Council would be more involved. **Council should decide whether to continue with professional recruiter or to explore LOC facilitation.**
- We will need a number of things early in the Recruiter process and should start on them now:
  - a) Compensation Package Outline and Limits. Comps analysis?
  - b) Job Description
  - c) Key characteristics for ideal candidate (the recruiter will work on this with us and help solicit community input, but we should have a go at it prior to start of recruiter contract).
    - **Sub-Committee could draft starting points for (a) and (b). Alternative plan?**
    - **How do we best define the compensation package ranges?**

# City of Hood River

## City Manager Recruiting Contractor RFP

Version sent 8-6-13

Subject: City of Hood River City Manager - Request for Proposal

Hello My name is Mark Zanmiller and I am a City Councilor for the City of Hood River, Oregon and part of a committee formed to review and recommend options for recruiting a new City Manager. We are confident that the best outcome will result from using a professional firm such as yours to lead the candidate identification process. Our next steps are to identify qualified firms, get answers to a few questions, down-select to firms that best fit our goals, schedule presentations to our selection committee, and select the firm that will partner with us in this effort.

We would greatly appreciate your consideration and submittal of a proposal which addresses the following questions. We are especially interested in your thoughts on our questions 2 through 6.

1. Please describe your recruitment process and how you will lead our efforts to find the next City Manager.
2. Please detail your experience with small "active" cities similar to Hood River. Provide your assessment of how the search process would be focused for our type of city.

*We are proud of our small city and want to make sure that the recruiting company understands our sense of place. The web site for the Hood River Chamber of Commerce does a good job of describing the community (<http://hoodriver.org/discover-hood-river>). Free-associating terms that describe Hood River, we came up with: diverse, active, educated, involved local community, environment, "quality of life" residents, high tech, tourism, and strong rural /agriculture roots.*

3. Expand on how you would include the public involvement and local stake-holders in the selection process? Do you look for us to define and introduce stake-holders?
4. Please identify your team that would provide the effort for Hood River, and what % of their time would be spent on our project during the selection process. Who will be the go-to person? Please provide a list of successes and references applicable to that team.
5. Please clarify the steps in the recruiting process where we define the important characteristics for the next City Manager. Is that a task for us to do prior to the start of this process, or is it part of the process facilitated by your firm?
6. We expect that you will have read some of the public discussion related to the departure of our previous City Manager. How would your firm help the City of Hood River address any issues that might affect the candidate pool?
7. Estimate costs and timeline for your services.
8. Define any guarantees included in your proposal.

We request that your response packet be sent by e-mail for our committee review. We would like to have a fairly aggressive schedule, where RFP responses could be received by the EOD on the 12<sup>th</sup> of August so we can complete our initial reviews, down select and schedule finalist presentations late in the week of the 19<sup>th</sup> (tentatively, Friday the 23<sup>rd</sup> of August). Please let us know if this schedule is too tight and we may push the schedule out somewhat.

Please feel free to contact us if you have questions or would like to discuss the opportunity. I can be reached at 541-387-4287, [mark.zanmiller@cityofhoodriver.com](mailto:mark.zanmiller@cityofhoodriver.com).

Sincerely,



# SCAPPOOSE

*Oregon*

January 10, 2014

CITY OF SCAPPOOSE  
CITY MANAGER RECRUITMENT  
REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS  
PROFESSIONAL RECRUITMENT CONSULTING SERVICES

## **INTRODUCTION**

The City of Scappoose is soliciting proposals from qualified professional firms with experience in the development, design and implementation of a customized recruitment process for the position of City Manager. The Scappoose City Manager left his position in November, 2013 and it is the goal of the city council to have a new City Manager selected and on the job as soon as possible. City of Scappoose was incorporated in 1921. The City serves a population of approximately 6700 residents plus numerous business owners. Scappoose provides the following services: police, planning, support service, parks, court, public works including streets, sewer and water.

The City is recognized by ICMA as a Council-Manager form of government. The governance of the City is vested in the City Council. The Council is composed of seven elected members, including the Mayor. The City Manager is appointed by the Council and is responsible for all city functions. The City employs 28 regular full-time employees plus seasonal and contract employees under the direction of the City Manager. The total City budget for FY 2013-14 is approximately \$11.6 million.

## **SCOPE OF PROFESSIONAL RECRUITMENT SERVICES**

The City wishes to conduct a search for a new City Manager within the western half of the country. The City is requesting professional assistance to develop a recruitment strategy and selection process. The project scope will be negotiated but will most likely include development of a candidate profile, creating a detailed recruitment schedule and a screening selection process to determine the best fit for Scappoose. Consideration should be given to the methods necessary to attract a variety of qualified candidates with appropriate experience.

The first phase of the work with the selected firm will be a meeting with the City to refine the scope of work, schedule and budget. Services may include:

- Work under the direction of the City Council to create and develop a timeline and recruitment/selection process which includes development of standards, criteria and policy directives used in hiring a City Manager.
- Provide the City with a clear written scope with projected costs and schedule. Include in your proposal your firm's policy/position should the recruitment and/or selection process prove to be unsuccessful.
- After evaluating input from the Mayor, Council, citizens, City Management Team and possibly others, the consultant will prepare a candidate and community profile for use in recruitment brochures.
- Consultant must be available to manage and oversee the recruitment process over the duration of the project (including participation in the interviews).
- Prepare a recruitment brochure and advertisement. The project cost proposal must include separately a proposed advertisement plan and an estimated budget. These expenses will be paid by the city.
- Project cost proposals must include consultant's lump sum payment schedule including a breakdown of billable costs and how they are to be charged. Billing terms and procedures should be clearly stated.
- Conduct the initial screening of applicants and provide a recommendation/ranking.
- Develop interview questions and a rating method for the Council to use (provide samples).
- Schedule interviews.
- Conduct a thorough background investigation on the finalist (propose specifics).
- Prepare all correspondence to applicants (provide samples).

All of the above elements must be addressed in the submittal in sufficient detail to allow the review committee to determine reasonableness of the planned approach and corresponding cost.

The City's goal is to provide an open and fair recruitment that will attract top talent while keeping costs reasonable. It is our desire to negotiate with the selected firm on components of the recruitment that we may or may not want to provide in-house. The consultant or firm shall enter into an agreement to include only those professional services agreed upon.

#### **CONTENT OF PROPOSALS AND SUBMITTAL DEADLINE**

Proposals should include a brief history and introduction of the company or firm. All proposals should include names or references from other public organizations for which comparable services have been rendered.

The deadline for receiving proposals is 4:00 pm on January 24, 2014. Proposals must be signed by an authorized individual from the firm and must be valid for at least 60 days.

**PROPOSALS ARE TO BE SUBMITTED IN A SEALED ENVELOPE AND CLEARLY MARKED ON THE FRONT OF THE ENVELOPE "CITY MANAGER RECRUITMENT PROPOSAL"**

**SUBMIT PROPOSALS TO:**

Donald H. Otterman, Interim City Manager  
City of Scappoose  
33568 East Columbia Ave.  
Scappoose, Oregon 97056

All questions or requests for information – call Donald Otterman, Interim City Manager at 503-543-7146.

The City reserves the right to reject any or all proposals. The City will not be liable for, nor pay any cost incurred by responding firms relating to the preparation of proposals or the making of presentations.

**PROPOSAL EVALUATION AND SELECTION**

An evaluation committee selected by the City Council shall evaluate the proposals based upon the following factors:

- a) Particular capability to perform the services required;
- b) Experienced staff available to perform the services required, including each Proposer's recent, current and projected workloads;
- c) Performance history;
- d) Approach and philosophy used in providing services;
- e) Fees or costs;
- f) References.

The City reserves the right to interview one or more firms submitting proposals prior to making a final decision to award a contract. The City will award the contract to the responsible proposer whose proposal the City determines to be the most advantageous to the City based upon the evaluation process and the evaluation factors and the outcome of negotiations, as described above. The City hopes to complete the consultant selection process and award a contract by February 3, 2014.